

1 **Common Metrics and Accountability Measures**
2 **Applicable to RFAs of the Division of Workforce & Economic Development**
3

4 **Background**

5 In 2004, Assembly Bill 1417 triggered the creation of a performance measurement system for the
6 California Community Colleges. That legislation and ensuing budget action authorized the California
7 Community Colleges Chancellor’s Office (CCCCO) to design and implement a performance measurement
8 system containing performance indicators for the system and its colleges. This comprehensive system is
9 known as the Accountability Reporting for the Community Colleges, or ARCC.

10
11 In 2012, the Student Success Task Force (SSTF) formed by Senate Bill 1143 recommended the
12 implementation of a new accountability framework to provide stakeholders with clear and concise
13 information on key student progress and success metrics in order to improve performance. The
14 recommendation emphasized that a scorecard be built on the existing ARCC reporting system.

15
16 Following adoption of the SSTF recommendations, the ARCC (2.0) Advisory Workgroup, which guided
17 the development of the initial accountability system in 2005, was reconvened. The workgroup had
18 representation by individuals from various community college organizations and stakeholder groups, as
19 well as researchers with technical expertise in performance measures. This technical workgroup
20 reviewed the existing framework and designed the new scorecard to be released across the system in
21 2013.

22
23 **ARCC 2.0 Framework**
24

25 The ARCC Advisory Workgroup recommends a four-tiered accountability framework, where each level
26 targets a different audience or user.

- 27 • The first level provides a report of the state of the system, a high level overview for legislators
28 and policy makers that summarizes a number of state level aggregations of data and annual
29 performance.
- 30 • The scorecard itself is the second level and measures progress and completion at each college
31 for various groups of student demographics, including those with different levels of college
32 preparation. This will be the core of the framework and part of the report that focuses on the
33 performance of each college and incorporates many of the recommendations from the SSTF,
34 such as providing metrics pertaining to momentum points, the disaggregation of metrics by
35 racial and ethnic groups and the inclusion of students taking less than 12 units.
- 36 • The third level is the ability to drill down further into the scorecard metrics through the existing
37 online query tool, Datamart 2.0 and for CTE, the addition of the LaunchBoard.
- 38 • The fourth and most detailed level is the ability for researchers to download the datasets (Data-
39 on-Demand) pertaining to each metric for their particular college.

40
41 The details of the above accountability framework can be viewed at the following URL:

42 http://extranet.cccco.edu/Portals/1/ExecutiveOffice/Board/2012_agenda/november/4_4_scorecard.pdf
43

1 **Measures**

2 The accountability for and measurement of grant activities administered through CCCC's Workforce
3 and Economic Development Division is based on the above ARCC 2.0 framework and augments that
4 work because scope of the Division's grants span from middle schools through community college as
5 well as post community college and into the workforce. Three categories of measures have been
6 included:

- 7
- 8 • *Quality of service (applies to key talent roles)*
- 9 • *Leading indicators of curriculum alignment to labor market needs*
- 10 • *Student momentum points*
- 11

12 Depending on the performance requirements of the funding stream from which the grant originated,
13 certain measures within these three categories will become more relevant, but the overriding objective
14 of moving the needle on student outcomes remains, rather than the prior practice of monitoring
15 activities and outputs.

16
17 With this unified framework of common metrics and accountability measures, funding and program
18 decisions can be more data-driven and evidence-based given what works in moving students towards
19 success.

20
21 **Quality of Service Measures**



22 Certain grants are designated as 'key talents' grants for the system. Key talents facilitate and promote
23 collaboration within a region, a sector, and/or their key constituents. These activities lead to quality of
24 services as measured by:

- 25
- 26 QS 0. 360-degree evaluation
27 The tool will be provided by the CCCC. Parties surveyed will give consideration to the
28 individual's performance in the following minimum areas:
- 29 QS 1. Leadership and responsiveness as a member of the Extended Operations Team of the
30 CCCC Division of Workforce and Economic Development.
- 31 QS 2. Strength of partnership with education and industry partners
- 32 QS 3. Strength of awareness and influence on state and regional policy related issues
- 33 QS 4. Strength of leadership and coordination in building of necessary supporting capacity,
34 such as center, advisories, collaborative communities, and a hub.
- 35

36 **Leading Indicators of Curriculum Alignment to Labor Market Needs**



37 A number of efforts take a long time to manifest in ARCC 2.0 outcomes, therefore the use of leading
38 indicators can serve as predictors of student progression in the interim. The following leading indicators
39 have been identified to facilitate alignment of educational programming to labor market needs.

- 40
- 41 • Occurrences of the following:
- 42 LI 1. Alignment of skillsets within a program (or set of courses) to a particular occupation
43 and the needs of the labor market
- 44 LI 2. Regionalization of stackable certificates aligned with a particular occupation ladder
- 45 LI 3. Alignment of a certificate with state-, industry-, nationally-, and/or employer-
46 recognized certification
- 47 LI 4. Creation of a credit certificate from non-credit certificate
- 48 LI 5. Curriculum articulation along a career or multi-career educational pathway

1 LI 6. Updating the skills of faculty, teachers, counselors, and/or ‘supporting staff to student’
2 to reflect labor market needs

3 LI 7. Integration of small business creation and/or exporting modules into for-credit
4 curriculum in other disciplines

- 5
- 6 • During 2013-14, Regional Consortia Chairs will report progress on Leading Indicators as part of
7 their Final Report. In subsequent years, employer-led advisory bodies will evaluate the
8 effectiveness of these efforts, on a scale of 1-5 where:

- 9 ✓ 5 = exceeds expectation
- 10 ✓ 4 = meets expectation
- 11 ✓ 3 = almost meets expectation
- 12 ✓ 2 = below expectation
- 13 ✓ 1 = does not meet expectation

14

15 **Student Momentum Points**

16 The data related to each momentum point will be collected automatically or if necessary, added
17 manually to the LaunchBoard. This information will provide visibility to the influence of the grant
18 expenditures on the success of our students. Not all momentum points must be or need to be satisfied
19 by each grantee. Grantees should refer to their work plans to determine which momentum points they
20 are responsible for documenting. Momentum points have been clustered according to the student’s
21 educational pathways for the reader’s convenience.

22

23 Note on definitions:

24

25 *CTE Pathways*

- 26 • For the Common Metrics, “CTE pathways” refer to clusters of related programs.
- 27 • To view the K-12 to CCC Program Code Crosswalk—a master list of which programs are included
28 in specific “CTE pathways,” which sector they belong to, and how they are aligned between K-
29 12, community colleges, and four-year universities—please visit
30 <http://doingwhatmatters.cccco.edu/LaunchBoard/ProgramCodeCrosswalk.aspx>.
- 31 • K-12 CTE Industry Sector Codes are based on the Course Group State Codes specified in the K-12
32 to CCC Program Code Crosswalk.
- 33 • Community College CTE Industry Sector Codes are based on the four-digit or six-digit Taxonomy
34 of Program (TOP) codes specified in the K-12 to CCC Program Code Crosswalk.
- 35 • Four-year University CTE Industry Sector Codes are based on the four-digit or six-digit
36 Classification of Instructional Program (CIP) codes specified in the K-12 to CCC Program Code
37 Crosswalk.
- 38 • If a program is assigned to an incorrect code in the K-12 to CCC Program Code Crosswalk, CTE
39 deans should send an email to launchboard@cccoco.edu to indicate their recommended
40 designation. This recommendation will then be reviewed by the Chancellor’s Office.

41

42 *CTE Students*

- 43 • Students are considered to be on a K-12 CTE pathway if they take one course while in high
44 school in a pathway identified in the K-12 to CCC Program Code Crosswalk or if grantees submit
45 information on students (such as participants in a career awareness workshop).
- 46 • Students are considered to be in a community college CTE pathway if they take one or more
47 courses while in community college in a pathway identified in the K-12 to CCC Program Code

- 1 Crosswalk or, for Momentum Point 33, if grantees submit information on individual learners
2 (participants in incumbent worker or contract education) in a pathway identified in the K-12 to
3 CCC Program Code Crosswalk.
- 4 • Students are considered to be in a four-year university/college CTE pathway if they declare a
5 major while in a four-year institution in a pathway identified in the K-12 to CCC Program Code
6 Crosswalk.
 - 7 • A first-time student is a student who enrolled in a community college for the first time after high
8 school (having not previously enrolled in a post-secondary educational institution).

9
10 The cohort of students included in the Common Metrics reflects a broad definition of CTE participation,
11 including students who enroll in apprenticeship programs and students who engage in short-term
12 course-taking. This is a more comprehensive definition of CTE participation than is used in California
13 Community Colleges Chancellor’s Office reports such as the CTE Scorecard and the Salary Surfer, to
14 ensure that information is gathered on students who do not complete programs as well as those who
15 do, to drive program improvement. In the future, the LaunchBoard will include the ability to filter
16 outcomes for multiple cohorts such as:

- 17
18 • A CTE participant cohort: students who have taken one or more apprenticeship or higher-level
19 courses (SAM code A, B, or C) within a specific CTE program
- 20 • The CTE Scorecard cohort: students who have taken more than 8 units of higher-level courses
21 (SAM code B or C) within a specific CTE program
- 22 • The CTE Outcomes Survey cohort: students who have taken 9 or more units, where at least one
23 course is apprenticeship or higher-level (SAM code A, B, or C), within any CTE program
- 24 • A low-unit skills-builder cohort: students who have taken 8 or fewer units, which may be
25 apprenticeship, higher-level, or introductory (SAM code A, B, C or D), within any CTE program
- 26 • Custom cohorts uploaded by a college

27 28 **Middle School Cluster**

SB
1070

- 29
30 MP 1. Completed an individual career and skills awareness workshop in middle school that
31 included a normed assessment process and was in a Doing What MATTERS priority or emerging
32 sector
- 33 • Data elements: Total number of students who participated in awareness workshops.
- 34 *Source: Grantee Activity Tracking*

35 **Transition from Middle School to High School**

SB
1070

- 36
37 MP 2. Completed a bridge program between middle school and high school and revised student
38 career/education plan
- 39 • Data elements: Total number of students who participated in bridge programs.
- 40 *Source: Grantee Activity Tracking*
- 41
42 MP 3. Completed a student orientation & assessment program while in middle school or high
43 school
- 44 • Data elements: Total number of students who completed orientation and assessment programs.
- 45 *Source: Grantee Activity Tracking*

1 **High School Cluster**

2
3 MP 4. Completed one course in high school within a CTE pathway

- 4 • Data elements: Statewide Student ID (SSID), Local Student ID, Last Name, First Name, Date of
5 Birth, Gender, High School CDS Code (County, District, School), Term and/or Academic Year,
6 California Basic Educational Data System Code (CBEDS), Taxonomy of Program (TOP) Code.

7 *Source: Cal-Pass Plus*
8

9 MP 5. Completed two or more courses in high school within a CTE pathway

- 10 • Data elements: Statewide Student ID (SSID), Local Student ID, Last Name, First Name, Date of
11 Birth, Gender, High School CDS Code (County, District, School), Term and/or Academic Year,
12 California Basic Educational Data System Code (CBEDS), Taxonomy of Program (TOP) Code.

13 *Source: Cal-Pass Plus*
14

15 MP 6. Completed a CTE articulated course

- 16 • Data elements: Total number of students who completed articulated courses.

17 *Source: CATEMA or Campus Submitted File*
18

19 MP 6A. Successfully completed a CTE dual enrollment course or credit by exam, with receipt of
20 transcribed credits

- 21 • Data elements: Total number of students who received transcribed credits for dual enrollment
22 courses and credit by exam.

23 *Source: CATEMA or Campus Submitted File*
24

25 MP 7. Completed a program in high school within a CTE pathway

- 26 • Data elements: Statewide Student ID (SSID), Local Student ID, Last Name, First Name, Date of
27 Birth, Gender, High School CDS Code (County, District, School), Term and/or Academic Year,
28 California Basic Educational Data System Code (CBEDS), Taxonomy of Program (TOP) Code.

29 *Source: Cal-Pass Plus*
30

31 **Transition from High School to College Cluster**

32
33 MP 8. Completed a bridge program between high school and college in a CTE pathway

- 34 • Data elements: Total number of students who completed a bridge program.

35 *Source: Grantee Activity Tracking*
36





37 MP 9. Completed college orientation & assessment as a first-time community college student who
38 entered a community college CTE pathway

- 39 • Data elements: Statewide Student ID (SSID), Local Student ID, Social Security Number, Last
40 Name, First Name, Date of Birth, Gender, High School CDS Code (County, District, School),
41 Community College IPEDS ID, Term and/or Academic Year, California Basic Educational Data
42 System Code (CBEDS), Taxonomy of Program (TOP) Code.



43 *Source: California Community Colleges Chancellor's Office*
44
45
46
47
48
49


- 1 MP 10. Transitioned from a high school CTE pathway to a similar community college CTE pathway
2 • Data elements: Statewide Student ID (SSID), Local Student ID, Social Security Number, Last
3 Name, First Name, Date of Birth, Gender, High School CDS Code (County, District, School),
4 Community College IPEDS ID, Term and/or Academic Year, California Basic Educational Data
5 System Code (CBEDS), Taxonomy of Program (TOP) Code.
6 *Source: Cal-Pass Plus*
7
- 8 MP 11. Transferred from a high school CTE pathway to a similar CSU, UC or private/independent
9 university CTE pathway
10 • Data elements: Statewide Student ID (SSID), Local Student ID, Social Security Number, Last
11 Name, First Name, Date of Birth, Gender, High School CDS Code (County, District, School),
12 University IPEDS ID, Term and/or Academic Year, California Basic Educational Data System Code
13 (CBEDS), Taxonomy of Program (TOP) Code, Four-Year University Classification of Instructional
14 Program (CIP) Code.
15 *Source: Cal-Pass Plus*
16
- 17 MP 12. Completed a counselor-approved college education plan, for first-time community college
18 students who enter a CTE pathway
19 • Data elements: Statewide Student ID (SSID), Local Student ID, Social Security Number, Last
20 Name, First Name, Date of Birth, Gender, Community College IPEDS ID, Term and/or Academic
21 Year, Taxonomy of Program (TOP) Code.
22 *Source: California Community Colleges Chancellor's Office*
23
- 24 MP 13. During high school, participated in an internship, work-based learning, mentoring, or job
25 shadowing program in a CTE pathway
26 • Data elements: Total number of students who participated in work-based learning activities.
27 *Source: Grantee Activity Tracking*
28
- 29 MP 14. Percentage of community college students, who participated in a high school CTE pathway,
30 whose first math or English course was below transfer-level
31 • Data elements: Statewide Student ID (SSID), Local Student ID, Social Security Number, Last
32 Name, First Name, Date of Birth, Gender, High School CDS Code (County, District, School),
33 Community College IPEDS ID, Term and/or Academic Year, California Basic Educational Data
34 System Code (CBEDS), Taxonomy of Program (TOP) Code, Basic Skills Courses Taken.
35 *Source: Cal-Pass Plus*
36

37 Community College Cluster



- 38
- 39 MP 15. Completed two courses in the same CTE Pathway  
40 • Data elements: Statewide Student ID (SSID), Local Student ID, Social Security Number, Last
41 Name, First Name, Date of Birth, Gender, Community College IPEDS ID, Term and/or Academic
42 Year, Taxonomy of Program (TOP) Code.
43 *Source: California Community Colleges Chancellor's Office*
44
- 45 MP 16. Retention rate between Fall and Spring within a CTE pathway  
46 • Data elements: Statewide Student ID (SSID), Local Student ID, Social Security Number, Last
47 Name, First Name, Date of Birth, Gender, Community College IPEDS ID, Term and/or Academic
48 Year, Taxonomy of Program (TOP) Code.
49 *Source: California Community Colleges Chancellor's Office*



1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49



MP 17. Completed a non-CCCCO-approved certificate within a CTE pathway  
• Data elements: Statewide Student ID (SSID), Local Student ID, Social Security Number, Last Name, First Name, Date of Birth, Gender, Community College IPEDS ID, Term and/or Academic Year, Taxonomy of Program (TOP) Code, Credit or Noncredit status.
Source: California Community Colleges Chancellor's Office



MP 18. Completed a CCCC-approved certificate within a CTE pathway 
• Data elements: Statewide Student ID (SSID), Local Student ID, Social Security Number, Last Name, First Name, Date of Birth, Gender, Community College IPEDS ID, Term and/or Academic Year, Taxonomy of Program (TOP) Code, Credit or Noncredit status.
Source: California Community Colleges Chancellor's Office



General Education and Transfer Progress Cluster

MP 19. Completed a work readiness soft skills training program within a CTE pathway  
• Data elements: Statewide Student ID (SSID), Local Student ID, Social Security Number, Last Name, First Name, Date of Birth, Gender, Community College IPEDS ID, Term and/or Academic Year, Taxonomy of Program (TOP) Code.
Source: Campus Submitted File

MP 20. Completed college level English and/or math, for students in a CTE pathway  
• Data elements: Statewide Student ID (SSID), Local Student ID, Social Security Number, Last Name, First Name, Date of Birth, Gender, Community College IPEDS ID, Term and/or Academic Year, College-Level English and Math Courses Passed, Taxonomy of Program (TOP) Code.
Source: California Community Colleges Chancellor's Office

MP 21. Completed the CSU-GE or IGETC transfer track/certificate for students  
in a CTE pathway
• Data elements: Statewide Student ID (SSID), Local Student ID, Social Security Number, Last Name, First Name, Date of Birth, Gender, Community College IPEDS ID, Term and/or Academic Year, Taxonomy of Program (TOP) Code.
Source: Campus Submitted file

MP 22. Completed requirements in a CTE pathway, but did not receive a certificate  
or a degree
• Data elements: Statewide Student ID (SSID), Local Student ID, Social Security Number, Last Name, First Name, Date of Birth, Gender, Community College IPEDS ID, Term and/or Academic Year, Taxonomy of Program (TOP) Code.
Source: Campus Submitted File

MP 23. Completed an associate degree in a CTE major  
• Data elements: Statewide Student ID (SSID), Local Student ID, Social Security Number, Last Name, First Name, Date of Birth, Gender, Community College IPEDS ID, Term and/or Academic Year, Taxonomy of Program (TOP) Code.
Source: California Community Colleges Chancellor's Office



1 MP 24. Completed an associate degree in a major different from student’s college
2 CTE pathway
3 • Data elements: Statewide Student ID (SSID), Local Student ID, Social Security Number, Last
4 Name, First Name, Date of Birth, Gender, Community College IPEDS ID, Term and/or Academic
5 Year, College Goal, Taxonomy of Program (TOP) Code.
6 *Source: California Community Colleges Chancellor’s Office*

8 MP 25. Transferred from community college to a four-year university in the same
9 CTE pathway
10 • Data elements: Statewide Student ID (SSID), Local Student ID, Social Security Number, Last
11 Name, First Name, Date of Birth, Gender, Community College IPEDS ID, University IPEDS ID,
12 Term and/or Academic Year, Taxonomy of Program (TOP) Code, Four-Year University
13 Classification of Instructional Program (CIP) Code.
14 *Source: Cal-Pass Plus*

16 MP 26. Transferred from community college to a four-year university in a major different
17 from their CTE pathway
18 • Data elements: Statewide Student ID (SSID), Local Student ID, Social Security Number, Last
19 Name, First Name, Date of Birth, Gender, Community College IPEDS ID, University IPEDS ID,
20 Term and/or Academic Year, Taxonomy of Program (TOP) Code, Four-Year University
21 Classification of Instructional Program (CIP) Code.
22 *Source: Cal-Pass Plus*

24 **Community College Transition to Workforce Cluster**

26 MP 27. Participated in a college internship or workplace learning program within
27 a CTE pathway
28 • Data elements: Statewide Student ID (SSID), Local Student ID, Social Security Number, Last
29 Name, First Name, Date of Birth, Gender, Community College IPEDS ID, Term and/or Academic
30 Year, Taxonomy of Program (TOP) Code.
31 *Source: Campus Submitted File*

33 MP 28. Attained a job placement in the same or similar field of study as CTE pathway
34 • Data elements: Statewide Student ID (SSID), Local Student ID, Social Security Number, Last
35 Name, First Name, Date of Birth, Gender, Community College IPEDS ID, Term and/or Academic
36 Year, Taxonomy of Program (TOP) Code.
37 *Source: CTE Employment Outcomes Survey or Campus Submitted File*

39 MP 29. Acquired an industry-recognized, third-party credential
40 • Data elements: Statewide Student ID (SSID), Local Student ID, Social Security Number, Last
41 Name, First Name, Date of Birth, Gender, Community College IPEDS ID, Term and/or Academic
42 Year, Taxonomy of Program (TOP) Code.
43 *Source: CTE Employment Outcomes Survey or Campus Submitted File*

44
45

1 **Workforce Progress Cluster**

2
3 MP 30. Attained a wage gain in a career in the same or similar CTE pathway



- 4 • Data elements: Statewide Student ID (SSID), Local Student ID, Social Security Number, Last
5 Name, First Name, Date of Birth, Gender, Community College IPEDS ID, Term and/or Academic
6 Year, Taxonomy of Program (TOP) Code.

7 *Source: CTE Employment Outcomes Survey or Campus Submitted File*

8
9 MP 31. Attained wages equal to or greater than the median entry level regional wage for
10 that CTE pathway



- 11 • Data elements: Statewide Student ID (SSID), Local Student ID, Social Security Number, Last
12 Name, First Name, Date of Birth, Gender, Community College IPEDS ID, Term and/or Academic
13 Year, Taxonomy of Program (TOP) Code, Wages Reported through the Unemployment Insurance
14 Database, Wages Reported through EMSI.

15 *Source: California Community Colleges Chancellor's Office*

16
17 MP 32. Attained wages greater than the regional standard-of-living wage



- 18 • Data elements: Statewide Student ID (SSID), Local Student ID, Social Security Number, Last
19 Name, First Name, Date of Birth, Gender, Community College IPEDS ID, Term and/or Academic
20 Year, Taxonomy of Program (TOP) Code, Wages Reported through the Unemployment Insurance
21 Database, Self Sufficiency Standards Designated by the Living Insight Center for Community
22 Economic Development.

23 *Source: California Community Colleges Chancellor's Office*

24
25 MP 33. Participated in incumbent worker training or contract education in a CTE



26 pathway (for example training for layoff aversion, meeting heightened occupational
27 credentialing requirement, transitioning employees whose occupations are being eliminated, or
28 up-skilling existing employees)

- 29 • Data elements: Last Name, First Name, Date of Birth, Gender, Community College IPEDS ID,
30 Term and/or Academic Year, Taxonomy of Program (TOP) Code, and optionally Social Security
31 Number.

32 *Source: LaunchBoard Additional Tracking Tool*

33
34 MP 34. Exception

35 For grants providing direct services to an employer, a group of employers, or an industry sector
36 or industry cluster (including Small Business and Global Trade), if there is no alignment with any
37 of the Student Momentum Points and/or Leading Indicators listed above, perform an
38 assessment of the purported 'beneficial impact' of the grant on the relevant businesses, which
39 may include a review of the grant's purported impacts on any of the following: increased
40 profitability, increased labor productivity, reductions in worker injuries, employer cost savings
41 resulting from improved business processes, improved customer satisfaction, increased
42 employee retention, increased number of employees, increased revenue projections, increased
43 sales, penetrated new markets, as well as information on new products or services developed.

- 44 • Data elements: Determined by grantees in conjunction with their grant monitors. Momentum
45 Point 34 outcomes will not be in the LaunchBoard.

46 *Source: Grantee Activity Tracking*